



Islamic Spiritual Counseling Approaches: Building the Values of Character Education through *Ta'alluq*, *Takhalluq* and *Tahaqquq* Methods

Nor Junainah Mohd Isa¹, Prio Utomo^{2*}

¹ Sultan Idris University of Education, Perak, Malaysia

² Institut Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan Siliwangi, Bandung, Indonesia

²prio.utomo@ikipsiliwangi.ac.id

*Correspondence

Article Information:

Received: August 2024

Revised: September 2024

Accepted: October 2024

Published: October 2024

Keywords:

Islamic Spiritual, Counseling Approaches, Values, Character Education

Kata Kunci:

Spiritual Islam, Pendekatan Konseling, Nilai-nilai, Pendidikan Karakter

Abstract

The problem of character today is that there is still little integration of religious concepts as a shaper of human character. This study aims to determine the values of character education using a psychosufistic (Sufism) approach through *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods. The research design used a qualitative-descriptive approach (hermeneutics). Data collection used primary and secondary data sources of Sufism texts (kitab-kitab). Data analysis used hermeneutic-psychosufistic analysis. The results showed that the teaching values that can be built in shaping human character include (1) the value of sincerity, (2) the value of willingness, (3) the value of patience, (4) the value of humility, (5) the value of tawakal, (6) the value of hope, (7) the value of fear, (8) the value of gratitude. This research contributes as enrichment material and human teachings about the procedures for growing character values (personality) by emphasizing spiritual management exercises using a psychosufistic (Sufism) approach through the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, *tahaqquq* methods.

Abstrak

Permasalahan karakter saat ini adalah masih sedikit integrasi konsep agama sebagai pembentuk karakter manusia. Tujuan penelitian ini untuk mengetahui nilai-nilai pendidikan karakter dengan menggunakan pendekatan psikosufistik (tasawuf) melalui metode *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, dan *tahaqquq*. Desain penelitian menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif-deskriptif (hermeneutika). Pengumpulan data menggunakan sumber data primer dan sekunder teks-teks (kitab-kitab) tasawuf. Analisis data menggunakan analisis hermeneutika-psikosufistik. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa nilai-nilai ajaran yang dapat dibangun dalam membentuk karakter manusia antara lain (1) nilai keikhlasan, (2) nilai kerelaan, (3) nilai kesabaran, (4) nilai kerendahan hati, (5) nilai tawakal, (6) nilai harapan, (7) nilai takut, (8) nilai syukur. Penelitian ini memberikan berkontribusi sebagai bahan pengayaan dan ajaran manusia tentang tata cara penumbuhan nilai-nilai karakter (kepribadian) dengan

menekankan latihan manajemen spiritual dengan menggunakan pendekatan psikosufistik (tasawuf) melalui metode *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, *tahaqquq*.

INTRODUCTION

Currently, it seems appropriate to revive the spirit of Sufism. This is considering the condition of human life in the modern era, which is actually surrounded by the degradation of values, morals, social, politics and everything that leads to a decrease in human dignity. Many people are found to be anxious about life as a result of their low values of the essential life ((Hill, 2019). Globalization and the digital era have had several significant impacts on modern human life. The impact that can be seen is that their lifestyle prioritizes the enjoyment of life or hedonism. Humans have become the object of worldly materialism, which indicates moral degradation (Glover, 2007). As a result, humans only consider how to process something so that it provides a lot of material benefits, regardless of what comes from Allah Swt and also elements (spirituality) that humans truly require.

What has been stated above seems to be in line with Erich Fromm's view of psychological anxiety in modern humans, i.e., humans' tendency in the modern age to suffer from mental instability and spiritual aridity-the spiritual dimension is gradually eroding, and value anomalies emerge. Modern human spirituality is currently flanked between the sophistication of science that opens space in the order of civilization and the desire to live freely without religious ties (Muedini, 2010). This is because humans continue to race and work hard to fulfill materialistic needs in their lives so that aspects of spirituality (religion) are not even considered (Van Bruinessen & Howell, 2007).

According to social problem observers, they assume that the characteristics of modern society will experience existential frustration marked by (1) the will to power, (2) the will to pleasure, (3) the will to money, (4) the will to work, (5) the will to sex (Weigel, 2004). Experts also consider modern times to be the century of man's fall, because there is no longer a soul of society that emerges as creatures of Allah Swt. The impact is the weakness of modern human character and personality values such as the values of honesty, modesty, justice, tolerance, religiosity, love of peace, harmony, helping one another, and social values of society.

How can humans in modern times return to the right path and neutralize materialistic, hedonistic, and totalitarian attitudes and behaviors?. There are numerous approaches that can be taken to address modern society's problems. One of them is to cultivate self-character values through a psychosufistic approach (Sufism). This approach focuses on the practices carried out by Sufism in getting closer to Allah Swt through the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods (practice). Sufism is a practice and self-training in which one returns to the way of Allah Swt through deep love and worship (Arberry, 2013). The purpose of Sufism ((Ernst, 2017) is to assist humans in properly

maintaining and increasing the purity of their souls, so that they can feel peace and return to their place of origin in peace.

The main assumption asserted here is that Sufism practice is relevant to modern human problems. The relevance in question is that Sufi practice can provide a sense of balance in one's life while also improving their spiritual (religious) aspects. Sufism practice can also reduce and prevent humans from adopting materialistic, hedonistic, and totalitarian attitudes and behaviors in their daily lives. Modern humans lead a consumptive lifestyle with increasing individualism in much of the modern world (Meena et al., 2017). In modern life, Sufism is a medicine that overcomes the spiritual crisis of modern humans regarding self-understanding and self-knowledge, meaning, and purpose of life.

The reinterpretation and contextualization of the psychosufistic approach (Sufism) can provide meaning when it is displayed in an applicative way in social life. The teachings of Sufism basically focus on self-centeredness and cleansing of the human soul to get closer to Allah Swt (Lumbard, 2007). The use of a psychosufistic approach (Sufism) in this discourse is based on psychosufism as a study of human behavior with a concept that is built on the science of Sufism based on the Al-Quran and Al-Hadith. In addition, the results of previous studies (Akhatov et al., 2020; Aljunied, 2016; Ibodilloevich, 2021; Karamatilloevich et al., 2020; Piraino, 2020; Rubaidi, 2018; Shah-Kazemi, 2002) reveal that Sufism learning method is able to improve human attitudes and behavior, and increase the spiritual values of their religion.

The discussion of the practice of Sufism that is the focus of this study is the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods. These three learning methods are teachings that direct people to know their identity better, as well as the Sufism path that leads them to the process of self-improvement. This learning methods includes three stages, i.e., (1) focusing the heart and mind only for Allah Swt, (2) imitating and following the attributes of Allah Swt so that humans have noble qualities as possessed by Allah Swt, (3) the ability to actualize their awareness and capacity as a Muslim who already has the attributes of Allah Swt so that it is reflected in their behavior. Through the stages of *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq*, humans will reach their rank before Allah Swt with all their capacities.

This study aims to build the values of character education using a psychosufistic approach (Sufism) through the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods. The focus of this discussion is on interpreting the books of Sufism and the meaning of the values of character education contained therein. In addition, the practice of Sufism is a medicine to overcome the crisis of modern human spirituality that has been lost due to the influence of modern times, so that modern humans are able to restore their lost dignity, and direct them to live in a better and clearer world.

METHOD

The research design for this study is a qualitative-descriptive approach. This research was carried out in 2021 by focusing on the target object of research which emphasizes subjective thinking and the object of research that is selected as an informant has a spiritualistic nature. The research approach method uses hermeneutics and psychosufistic methods. These methods are used to provide meaning and content of thoughts about Sufism (psychosufistic) through the practice of *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, *tahaqquq*, and their influence on the cultivation of the values of character education. Sources of research data include (1) primary data, i.e., the works of philosophers (books) with the theme of Sufism; (2) secondary data, i.e., books that have relevance and support, as well as the results of previous studies. Data collection methods are documentation studies and literature review. Data analysis uses content analysis. The stages in this analysis include (1) Data reduction, this process is carried out with the intention of classifying, centralizing, and organizing data for verification and conclusion process, (2) Presentation of data, i.e., the process of data exposure that is presented systematically, i.e., describing a picture of research data, (3) Verification and drawing conclusions, i.e., the process of verifying field data and interpreting conclusions.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Concept of Islamic Spiritual Counseling Approach (Ta'alluq, Takhalluq and Tahaqquq)

Psychosufistic approach (Sufism) is a new concept or science after the time of the Prophet Muhammad and his companions. The Sufism movement emerged around the 2nd century Hijri which aims to remind about the nature of life as a result of economic life, social order, and cultural hedonism entering humans and neglecting the spiritual side (Bilqies, 2014). The followings are Sufism prominent figures (Milani, 2014) with their teachings: (1) *Al-khauf wa al-raja* by Hasan Al-Bashri, (2) *Al-Fana, Al-Baqa, Ittihad* by Abu Yazid Al-Busthomi, (3) *Al-mahabbah* by Rabi'ah Al-Adawiyyah, (4) *Ihya Ulumuddin* by Imam Al-Ghazali, (5) *Al-Furqon baina Awliya al-Rohman wa Awliya al-Syaithon* by Ibn Taimiyah; (6) *Fushush al-Hikam* by Ibn 'Araby, (7) *Al-tadbi fi at-Tasawuf* by Ibn Athaillah, (8) *ar-Rasail* by Imam Junaid Al-Baghdadi.

The psychosufistic paradigm or another term called Sufistic psychology is a study that explores the spiritual aspect. A Sufism is a person or a Sufism expert who studies the science of Sufism (J. D. Howell, 2001). Psychosufism is also called Sufism because it contains teachings about the science of Sufism. Sufism is a concept that focuses on human concepts, behaviors, and beliefs. The psychosufistic approach (Sufism) is a teaching method by emphasizing the role of psychological aspects based on intuitive strategies (*al-hadsiyah*), inspiration, and feelings (*al-dzawqiyah*) (Corbin, 2014). The strategy in question is through sharpening the structure of inner feelings through a process of self-purification (*tazkiyah al-nafs*).

The purpose of the practice of Sufism boils down to an attempt to distance oneself from the luxuries of the world. This goal is to have direct contact with Allah Swt and to

have the feeling that they are truly on the side of Allah Swt (Heck, 2006). Specifically, the purpose of Sufism is to (1) save people from sin and shirk, (2) free oneself from emotional diseases, (3) feel oneself with noble Islamic character, (4) reach the value of *ihsan* in worship, (5) reach for the strength of faith that was once owned by the companions of the Prophet Muhammad, (6) be able to restore clean and correct leadership, both political and economic elements; (7) save people and the nation from the destruction of morals and behavior of the world (Kucuk, 2008).

Mainstream psychosufistic approach (Sufism) is an effort to grow and develop the values of human character (identity). In the process, there are many methods or ways that are carried out in the practice of Sufism, some of them are the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods. The *ta'alluq* method is a human effort to always remember and increase awareness of the human heart and mind to Allah Swt. This method emphasizes that humans should not be separated from thinking and remembrance of Allah Swt.

In essence, the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods are procedures or ways to lead people to become more familiar with the values of character education (identity). The three methods emphasize spiritual practice with full sincerity, certain practices, and spiritual mental readiness as an effort to process self-improvement. The following discussion describes the process of the stages of *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods:

First, in *ta'alluq*, the process focuses the humans' heart and mind are only for Allah Swt. This process emphasizes that humans always and strive to remember and bind the consciousness of their heart and mind to Allah Swt. Humans by undergoing Sufism practices cannot be separated from thinking and continuing to perform *dhikr* to Allah Swt. This process prioritizes trying to remember and binding the consciousness of the human heart and mind to Allah Swt. Whatever, however, and wherever the human condition is, then they are bound and cannot be separated from thinking and remembrance of Allah Swt (Langko, 2014).

Second, in *takhalluq*, this process emphasizes that humans consciously imitate the attributes of Allah Swt so that later they have the noble qualities as the attributes of Allah Swt. This process is also known as the process of internalizing the nature of Allah SWT into humans (adoption) (Langko, 2014). In order to successfully carry out this process, it is necessary to know Allah Swt and His attributes. Introduction to Allah Swt can be done in two ways: (1) It is theoretical in nature, i.e., studying philosophy or studying al-Kalam Science/Islamic Theology, (2) Practical in nature, i.e., tracing the path that leads to the introduction of Allah Swt (Shihab, 2016).

Third, in *tahaqquq*, this process directs humans to actualize their awareness and capacity as a Muslim as reflected in the *takhalluq* process. *Tahaqquq* is humans' ability to actualize their awareness and capacity as a Muslim to always apply the attributes of Allah Swt in their daily life behavior. This process is the final process towards a perfect human being formed by understanding and recognizing human nature it self (human traits), then arriving at Allah Swt (the attributes of Allah Swt) (Langko, 2014).

From the practice of psychosufistic approach (Sufism) through the *ta'alluq*,

takhalluq, and *tahaqquq* methods as described above, it is clear that the three methods are a process of training oneself in daily life (*riyadhah*), combating lust and staying away from worldly dependence, and humans' efforts to draw closer to Allah Swt. Strictly speaking, humans will achieve their status as creatures of Allah Swt with mighty but loving and peaceful capacities through the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods (Al-Husaini, 2016).

The series of literature as described above becomes the fulcrum of academic studies that discuss the psychosufistic paradigm. In essence, this study is based on and refers to the values and heritage of the past Sufism. The psychosufistic approach (Sufism) through the practice of *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* is an esoteric dimension of Islam and has relevance to Islamic psychology. There are at least four main characteristics in the psychosufistic approach (Sufism), including: (1) this approach puts forward the dimension of feeling; (2) people who follow the path of Sufism believe that they have reached human nature as creatures of Allah Swt; (3) the peak condition of life can be felt temporarily, quickly disappears, although it leaves a deep impression and cannot be forgotten; and (4) everything or the experienced condition is a form of grace and blessing that cannot be sought.

Building Character Education Values Through Islamic Spiritual Counseling Approach

Psychosufistic approach (Sufism) is a teaching which states that the essence of a person's value is not in their physical form but in the purity and nobility of their heart, so that they can be as close as possible to Allah Swt (Schwartz, 2008). Sufism is an effort to purify oneself (*tazkiyyatunnafs*) by keeping away from the influence of worldly life that causes neglect of Allah Swt to then focus their attention only on Allah Swt (Scharbrodt, 2007). In its scope, the science of Sufism contains four elements, including (1) metaphysics, (2) ethics, i.e., good and bad human behavior; (3) psychology, (4) aesthetics. The science of Sufism is a demand for humans as a guide to life, discarding what is not in accordance with applicable guidelines, then vigorously heading to the path of glory (Sultanova, 2011). The spiritual dimension of humans from a psychosufistic perspective (sufism) underscores the core of human existence, focusing on spirituality or psychology (Utomo et al., 2024). Character values embedded through the practice of Sufism (*tarekat*) are repentance, patience, poverty, surrender, *taqwa*, *tawakkal*, *mahabbah* (love), *makrifat* and *ridha* (willingness) (Zubaedi & Utomo, 2021).

The findings reveal that the psychosufistic approach (Sufism) is a study of progressive innovation or a field of science that refers to the legacy of Sufism teachings (Sedgwick, 2016) in carrying out the practice of Sufism. The values of character education embedded in the practice of psychosufistic approach (Sufism) through the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods are teachings on the ethics of human life including simplicity, avoiding the pleasures of the world, freeing oneself, modesty, patience, sincerity. In their stages, the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods can be taken through three stages: (1) the initial stage (*al-bidâyah*), (2) the stage of sincerity in doing good (*al-mujâhadah*), (3) stage of feeling (*al-mudzîqât*) (Knysh, 2019).

Other findings also reveal that efforts to build the values of character education have actually been described in the book of al-Hikam by Ibn Ataillah. He explained that there are eight values of the heart (soul) that are embedded in psychosufistic approach (Sufism) practice. The eight values of character education are described as follows:

First, **the value of sincerity** (*al-Ikhlās*) teaches humans to always sincerely gracefully accept all their trials and problems in life with all their hearts. Sincerity implies that all actions and actions taken by humans are all based on sincere intentions, submission to oneself, not to seek attention and praise, and all of those are only for Allah Swt. Strictly speaking, this value places sincerity as the first step that humans must take from all the work they do without any element of coercion (Nurcholis, 2012).

Second, **the value of willingness** (*ridha*) teaches humans to always be willing to accept gracefully without any disappointment or pressure over all the trials and problems in life. Humans accept all the events that are happening to them with full willingness, grace, steadfast, and without being easily discouraged. Strictly speaking, this value places willingness as a step that humans must take when facing all forms of life's problems even though they are heavy, and believe that all of them are trials from Allah Swt to be faced (Mustofa, 2018).

Third, **the value of patience** teaches humans to always instill patient attitudes and behaviors, i.e., being able to withstand all difficulties in life, able to withstand, not easily discouraged, not easy to complain, and leave everything to Allah Swt. Patience implies an ability, toughness, and tenacity in overcoming problems progressively, creatively, and continuously in accordance with religious instructions (Izutsu, 2016). Strictly speaking, this value places patience as a step that must be taken by humans so that they are not easily tempted by the pleasures of the world, are able to defeat and control their passions.

Fourth, **the value of modesty** (*tawadhu*) teaches humans to always be humble, not arrogant in attitude and behavior, and all humans are equal before Allah Swt. Through an attitude of modesty, it will give birth to a calm, authoritative, gentle heart attitude, not having an attitude that tends to demean others. Strictly speaking, this value places modesty as a value of goodness (modesty), i.e., the value of moral goodness that can be seen and measured from being able to know one's limitations, imperfections, mistakes, openness, and mutual respect for other individuals (Geoffroy, 2010).

Fifth, **the value of trust/belief** (*tawakal*) teaches humans to always believe that Allah Swt always sees what humans do in life, and to surrender everything with full confidence for all the efforts that have been made and the results that will be obtained later (Cornell, 2010). This value places humans to have confidence and trust that Allah Swt has determined and chosen a way of life for themselves, not full hope with fellow human beings. Strictly speaking, this belief value prioritizes Allah Swt as the main element who can provide help, not hope for humans.

Sixth, **the value of hope** (*raja*) teaches people to always hope through an optimistic attitude, not to give up easily, always think positively, and be hopeful of Allah's help. This value places humans to always have an optimistic mental attitude in expecting gifts and favors from Allah Swt for His servants who do good deeds, and is accompanied

by efforts that are getting closer to the goals they want to achieve (J. Howell, 2012). Strictly speaking, this value places a sense of hope as a value that humans must have to get help and a good way of life.

Seventh, **the value of fear** (*khauf*) teaches humans to have a mental attitude that has fear, anxiety, and worry to Allah Swt because they feel lacking in carrying out obligations and prohibitions that have been set, and have a dangerous impact in the future. This fearful attitude will make people always be careful in doing everything, for fear if something they do is wrong in front of Allah Swt, and will always try to do better (Knysh, 2019). Strictly speaking, this value places human fear as an impetus to move themselves to correct the mistakes they have made.

Eighth, **the value of gratitude** teaches humans to always be grateful for all that has been obtained and the protection that has been given to him. This gratitude implies expressing and saying gratitude sincerely both in the heart and in their speech, and then applying gratitude into positive actions such as acts of worship as gratitude for all the blessings that have been given by Allah Swt (Nielsen et al., 2006). Strictly speaking, this value places human gratitude as a form of acknowledging and believing that all the blessings that have been obtained are all gifts from Allah Swt.

Based on the eight embedded values as described above, these values mean that the psychosufistic approach (Sufism) is basically an effort to transcend various learning actions and activities and how humans can manage their feelings, hearts, desires, and soul appropriately. According to (Geoffroy, 2010) revealing that the psychosufistic approach (Sufism) has doctrinal values contained in it, including (1) the value of unity (*tawhid*), (2) human values, (3) the value of modesty, (4) local wisdom, (5) the value of self-change. The five values of the teachings become the foundation in shaping the personality of Muslims who are faithful, pious, and having good character.

Based on the revealed findings, the values of character education that can be built and instilled in humans using a psychosufistic approach (Sufism) through the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods are noble behavior (*akhlakul kharimah*) and pious. Aspects of the developed the values of character education include (1) good prejudice (*husnudzon*), (2) self-introspection, (3) obey the teachings (*istiqomah*).

CONCLUSION

The psychosufistic approach (Sufism) through the *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods is basically an effort to transcend various actions and learning activities and how humans can manage feelings, hearts, desires, and souls appropriately. There are eight teaching values that can be built in shaping human character, including (1) the value of sincerity (*al-Ikhlas*), (2) the value of willingness (*ridha*), (3) the value of patience, (4) the value of modesty (*tawadhu*), (5) the value of trust (*tawakal*), (6) the value of hope (*raja*), (7) the value of fear (*khauf*), (8) the value of gratitude. Other findings reveal that there are four main characteristics in the psychosufistic approach (Sufism): (1) this approach emphasizes the feeling dimension, (2) people who follow the path of Sufism believe that they have reached human nature as creatures of Allah Swt, (3) the peak

condition of life can be felt temporarily, quickly disappears, although it leaves a deep impression and cannot be forgotten; and (4) everything or the experienced condition is a form of grace and blessing that cannot be sought.

For recommendations, the results of this study contribute as enrichment materials and teachings to humans about procedures for growing character values (personality) by emphasizing spiritual management exercises using a psychosufistic approach (Sufism) through *ta'alluq*, *takhalluq*, and *tahaqquq* methods.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors would like to thank the many colleagues who have provided information and facilitated the research process. We would also like to thank each of the authors who have been willing to collaborate on this research, hopefully it can be continued into future research.

REFERENCES

- Akhatov, L., Rasulov, A., Mirzorakhimov, O., Sharipov, M., & Ibrokhimov, F. (2020). The Outlookings of Religious and Sufism in Teaching of Abdurakhman Jamiy. In *ECLSS Online* (p. 62).
- Al-Husaini. (2016). *Asmaul Husna*. Zaman.
- Aljunied, K. (2016). Reorienting Sufism: Hamka and Islamic Mysticism in the Malay World. *Indonesia*, 101, 67–84. <https://doi.org/10.5728/indonesia.101.0067>
- Arberry, A. (2013). *Sufism: An account of the mystics of Islam*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Corbin, H. (2014). *Creative imagination in the Sufism of Ibn Arabi*. Princeton University Press.
- Cornell, V. (2010). *Realm of the saint: Power and authority in Moroccan Sufism*. University of Texas Press.
- Ernst, C. (2017). *Sufism: An introduction to the mystical tradition of Islam*. Shambhala Publications.
- Geoffroy, E. (2010). *Introuduction to Sufism: The Inner Path of Islam*, trans. Roger Gaetani (Indiana: World Wisdom).
- Glover, J. (2007). *Sufism and jihad in modern Senegal: The Murid order*. University Rochester Press.
- Heck, P. L. (2006). Mysticism as Morality: The Case of Sufism. *Journal of Religious Ethics*, 34(2), 253–286. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jore.2006.34.issue-2>
- Hill, J. (2019). Sufism Between Past and Modernity. In *Handbook of Contemporary Islam and Muslim Lives* (pp. 1–26).
- Howell, J. (2012). Sufism and neo-sufism in Indonesia today. *RIMA: Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs*, 46(2), 1–24.
- Howell, J. D. (2001). Sufism and the Indonesian Islamic Revival. *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 60(3), 701–729. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2700107>

- Ibodilloevich, N. (2021). The Sufi-Philosophical views of Hujviri on correlation of Gnoseology of Sufism, Rational and Irrational Learning. *Central Asian Journal of Social Sciences and History*, 2(3), 61–73.
- Izutsu, T. (2016). *Sufism and Taoism: A comparative study of key philosophical concepts*. Univ of California Press.
- Karamatilloevich, A., Abduvaliyevich, M., & Kudratullayevich, X. (2020). The spiritual connection of Sufism and Tolerance in the works of Jami. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Publications (IJMRAP)*, 2(11), 1–4.
- Knysh, A. (2019). *Sufism: A New History of Islamic Mysticism*. Princeton University Press.
- Kucuk, H. (2008). A Brief History of Western Sufism. *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 36(2), 292–320.
- Langko, M. (2014). Metode Pendidikan Rohani Menurut Agama Islam. *Jurnal Ekspose*, 23(1), 46–66.
- Lumbard, J. (2007). From Ḥubb to ‘Ishq: The Development of Love in Early Sufism. *Journal of Islamic Studies*, 18(3), 345–385.
- Meena, S., William, R., & Merin, S. (2017). *Contemporary Sufism: Piety, politics, and popular culture*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Milani, M. (2014). *Sufism in the secret history of Persia*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Muedini, F. (2010). Examining Islam and human rights from the perspective of Sufism. *Muslim World Journal of Human Rights*, 7(1).
- Mustofa, A. (2018). Pendidikan Tasawuf Solusi Pembentukan Kecerdasan Spiritual dan Karakter. *Jurnal Inovatif*, 4(1), 111–139.
- Nielsen, J., Draper, M., & Yemelianova, G. (2006). *Transnational Sufism: The Haqqaniyya. In Sufism in the West*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Nurcholis, A. (2012). Peran Tasawuf dalam Merekonstruksi Krisis Spiritualitas Manusia Modern. *SOSIO-RELIGIA*, 10(1), 109–132.
- Piraino, F. (2020). Sufism Meets the New Age Discourse: Part 1: A Theoretical Discussion. *International Journal for the Study of New Religions*, 11(1).
- Rubaidi, R. (2018). The Role of Urban Sufism of Shalawat Muhammad Assembly on Urban Middle Class Society. *Jurnal Ushuluddin*, 26(2).
- Scharbrodt, O. (2007). The Salafiyya and Sufism: Muhammad ‘Abduh and his Risālat al-Wāridāt (Treatise on Mystical Inspirations). *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studie*, 70(1), 89–115.
- Schwartz, S. (2008). *The other Islam: Sufism and the road to global harmony*. Harmony.
- Sedgwick, M. (2016). *Western Sufism: From the Abbasids to the new age*. Oxford University Press.
- Shah-Kazemi, R. (2002). The notion and significance of Ma ‘rifa in Sufism. *Journal of Islamic Studies*, 13(2), 155–181.
- Shihab, M. (2016). *Yang Hilang dari Kita: Akhlak*. Lentera Hati.

- Sultanova, R. (2011). *From Shamanism to Sufism: Women, Islam and Culture in Central Asia*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Van Bruinessen, M., & Howell, J. (2007). (Eds.) *Sufism and the 'Modern' in Islam*. London: Ib tauris.
- Weigel, V. (2004). *Knowledge of God in Classical Sufism: Foundations of Islamic Mystical Theology*. Paulist Press.